# **Citizen Participation in the Consultative Councils for Sustainable Development** (CCDS) in Southeast Mexico: An Academic Perspective

# La participación ciudadana en los Consejos Consultivos para el Desarrollo Sustentable (CCDS) en Sureste mexicano: Una visión académica

#### GÓMEZ-RIVERA, Petrona\*†

ID 1st Author: Petrona, Gómez-Rivera

Received March 11, 2020; Accepted June 30, 2020

#### Abstract

In Mexico, since 1995 a Citizens Advisory Council involved in the analysis of environmental policies and offer recommendations to the Federal Government was formed. The academic sector is part of these Councils, and the following research questions were raised: councils are performing the functions set out in the Regulations? Which of these functions is the incident?. With this, the objective was to measure the level of participation of these citizens advice in a state of the Mexican Southeast. The methodology consisted of applying a questionnaire to identify the areas of greatest impact and citizen participation, responses were evaluated based on a scale (Likert), the instrument was applied to 90% of pariticpantes of CCDS, it was validated with Cronbach's alpha, obtaining acceptable reliability of 0.70. As a result of data analysis, it was found that the highest incidence of involvement of the Council, is in the role of recommendations with 44.4%, determining a moderate level Likert scale. From the academic perspective, this paper contributes a qualitative measurement insturmento participation of the Council, but at the same time, will encourage others and more robust instruments and strategies for improvement in the Councils.

# Civil participation, Civil advices, Environmental policy

#### Resumen

En México, desde 1995 se conformó un grupo de Consejeros Ciudadanos que participan en el análisis de las políticas ambientales y ofrecen recomendaciones al Gobierno Federal. El sector académico forma parte de dichos Consejos, y se plantearon las siguientes preguntas de investigación: ¿los Consejos están realizando las funciones establecidas en su Reglamento? ¿cuál de estas funciones es la más incidente?. Con lo anterior, el objetivo fue medir el nivel de participación de estos Consejos Ciudadanos en un estado del Sureste mexicano. La metodología consistió en la aplicación de un cuestionario para identificar las áreas de mayor incidencia o participación ciudadana, las respuestas se valoraron con base en una escala (Likert), el instrumento se aplicó al 90% de pariticpantes del CCDS, mismo que fue validado con el alfa de Cronbach, obteniendo una confiabilidad aceptable del 0.70. Como resultado del análisis de los datos, se observó que la mayor incidencia de participación del Consejo, se encuentra en la función de recomendaciones, con el 44.4%, determinando un nivel moderado en la escala de Likert. Desde la perspectiva académica, el presente trabajo contribuye con un insturmento cualitativo de medición de la participacion del Consejo, pero a la vez, propiciará otros y más robustos instrumentos, así como, las estrategias de mejora en los Consejos.

Participación ciudadana, Consejos Ciudadanos, Política ambiental.

**Citation:** GÓMEZ-RIVERA, Petrona. Citizen Participation in the Consultative Councils for Sustainable Development (CCDS) in Southeast Mexico: An Academic Perspective. Journal-Urban-Rural and Regional Economy. 2020. 4-6: 8-11

<sup>†</sup> Researcher contributing as first author.

<sup>\*</sup> Correspondence to Author (email: pgomez.tc@uttab.edu.mx)

# Introduction

In Inclusive Mexico, social policies that promote citizen participation, transparency and accountability are elements that foster development with statistical evidence to evaluate and feed back into social programmes (PND 2013-2018).

On the issue of environmental governance, the Consultative Council for Sustainable Development (CCDS) has had an important trajectory since 1995, in which it exercises the functions of advising, recommending, analysing and evaluating public environmental policies (LGEEPA, 2008).

Throughout its 20-year history, the CCDS has had the participation of around two thousand advisors from various sectors: academia, business, youth, indigenous peoples, social organisations, gender and women, who together have analysed specific environmental situations and have made recommendations to SEMARNAT and the corresponding bodies such as CONAGUA, CONAFOR, PROFEPA, among others (http////). among others (http////).

During 3-year cycles, each generation of Councillors issues a historical document called White Papers, in which the experiences achievements obtained. and the recommendations made, the attendance to meetings, as well as the participation in other consultative bodies, are reflected in the form of reports. In spite of having these documents and information concentrated over 20 years, it can be seen that there are a significant number of recommendations, but the significance of these works in Mexican environmental policy is unknown.

Therefore, and from an academic perspective, the trajectory of the CCDS deserves to be evaluated with instruments that make it possible to measure the level of citizen participation and its impact or incidence on environmental policies that have promoted sustainable development in our country. This work offers a semi-quantitative measurement instrument, based on the following basic research questions: Are the Councils carrying functions established out the in their Regulations? Which of these functions is the most important?

# Objective

The objective of the study was to determine the level of impact or incidence of the functions exercised by a CCDS in Southeast Mexico during the period 2008-2011. This will contribute to having information to improve the management of the CCDS at the governmental level and to accurately assess the results.

# Method

An instrument (questionnaire) was designed, based on the four functions of the CCDS (advising, recommending, analysing and evaluating public environmental policies), with nine items, whose response options were assessed on a Likert scale.

The dependent variable was the impact of the CCDS, and the independent variable was the applicability of the work generated by the CCDS. The target population for the application of the instrument was all CCDS councillors in southeastern Mexico.

To determine the reliability (precision or accuracy) of the measurement instrument, Cronbach's Alpha Coefficient (1) was applied, with which the variances of the items and the variance of the total score were obtained, establishing a minimum required value of 0.7.

$$\alpha = \frac{K}{K-1} \left[1 - \frac{\sum S_i^2}{S_T^2}\right]$$
(1)

Donde :

 $\begin{array}{ll} \mathbf{K} &= \mathrm{n}\mathrm{\acute{u}mero}~\mathrm{d}\mathrm{e}~\mathrm{\acute{t}tems}\\ \sum \mathbf{S}_i^2 &= \mathrm{varianza}~\mathrm{d}\mathrm{e}\mathrm{l}~\mathrm{total}~\mathrm{d}\mathrm{e}~\mathrm{filas}\\ \mathbf{S}_T^2 &= \mathrm{varianza}~\mathrm{d}\mathrm{e}~\mathrm{las}~\mathrm{sumas}~\mathrm{d}\mathrm{e}~\mathrm{los}~\mathrm{i}\mathrm{tems} \end{array}$ 

In order to determine the impact of the Advisory Council, descriptive statistics and Likert scale response frequencies were used for the data on the functions of the Councillors and the impact or incidence of the work carried out by the Council under study.

GÓMEZ-RIVERA, Petrona. Citizen Participation in the Consultative Councils for Sustainable Development (CCDS) in Southeast Mexico: An Academic Perspective. Journal-Urban-Rural and Regional Economy. 2020

#### Results

## **Application of the instrument**

With the support of the President of the selected Council, and as a general subject of an ordinary meeting held in April 2015, the Councillors and authorities of SEMARNAT of the State Delegation were informed of the objective of the research project and were invited to actively participate in the process of applying the questionnaire, which was sent to them electronically, through the official mail of the technical secretary of the Council.

During the months of April to June 2015, the applied instruments were received.

The expected goal was the participation of all councillors, resulting in 90% of participating councillors.

### Validation of the instrument

The results obtained were processed in an Excel 2013 spreadsheet, descriptive statistics were applied, and the frequencies of responses were calculated on a Likert scale.

Subsequently, the Cronbach's alpha formula was developed, obtaining a 0.70 level of reliability of the instrument, which is considered an acceptable correlation between the items of the instrument applied (Cortina 1993, Streiner 2003 in Oviedo 2005).

Participation of Board Members with respect to the functions performed

With regard to the indicators of the functions and impact of the work carried out by the Board members, the percentage of responses on the Likert scale (0=nil, 1=low, 2=moderate, 3=high) was analysed, and it was found that 55.6% consider the function of issuing recommendations to be moderate, the functions of evaluating specific issues to be low with 66.7% and the function of advising to be nil, with 66.7% (Table 1).

Estimating the impact of the work carried out by the Council

In reference to the impact of the Council's work, Table 2 shows that 44.4% of the Councillors are of the opinion that the applicability of the work issued is moderate; on the other hand, the administrative response time for the work issued by the Council has a low scale value, with 77.7% of the responses; and 44.4% express no participation in advisory work on specific projects (Table 2).

The results obtained do not have a reference point with which to argue, but the methodology used must be reinforced with a conceptual and analytical framework that allows for the integration of information from other primary sources in order to design robust indicators and evaluation instruments.

Item	Porcentaje de frecuencias	Escala de Likert que presento la mayor frecuencia
Asistencia a reuniones del Consejo	55.6	1= bajo
Participación en la función de asesoría	66.7	0=nulo
Participación en las función de emitir recomendaciones	55.6	2= moderado
Participación en la función de evaluar asuntos específicos	44.4	1= bajo
Participación en la función de evaluar resultados de los programas, políticas y acciones	66.7	1= bajo

 Table 1 Results of Councillors' participation in specific functions

 C
 D D 2015

Source: Gómez R.P.2015

	11
Journal-Urban-Rural	and Regional Economy
	June, 2020 Vol.4 No.6 8-11

Item	Porcentaje de frecuencias	Escala de Likert que presento la mayor frecuencia
El esfuerzo de		
trabajo realizado	44.4	l= bajo
es		_
Tiempo de		
respuestas		
administrativas	77.7	l= bajo
para los trabajos		-
que emitieron, es:		
Interés		
administrativo	55.5	2=
hacia los trabajos	33.5	moderado
que emitieron, es:		
La operatividad de		
los procesos		
administrativos e	55.6	l= bajo
internos del		
Consejo es:		
La aplicabilidad		2=
de los trabajos que	44.4	2= moderado
emitieron, es:		moderado
El número de		
asesorías	55.5	0=nulo
realizadas a la	33.5	0=nulo
fecha, es:		
El número de		
recomendaciones	55.5	l= bajo
realizadas a la	55.5	I- dajo
fecha, es:		
El número de		
evaluaciones	55.5	l= bajo
específicas:		
El número de		
evaluaciones de		
resultados de		
programas,	44.4	0=nulo
políticas y	44.4	0=nuio
acciones,		
realizadas a la		
fecha, es:		

 Table 2 Outcome of the impact of the work carried out by the Council

 Council

Source: Gómez R.P.2015

#### Acknowledgement

We would like to thank the support and management of the CCDS in the Mexican Southeast as well as the corresponding State Delegation of SEMARNAT.

Likewise, to the Technological University of Tabasco for the facilities provided for the research, and to the Council of Science and Technology of the State of Tabasco, for the support provided in the training of a human resource as a research assistant through the New Talents Programme.

#### Conclusion

It is considered that the impact or incidence of a CCDS in Southeast Mexico on environmental policy is moderate, that of the four main functions of the Council, that of issuing recommendations is the most recurrent, and the opposite is the case of the advisory function, which is considered to be null.

On the other hand, the moderate level of enforceability of the work issued by the Council may be due to the low response of the administrative time to be expected to be enforceable.

The results provide qualitative information, which should be reinforced with other methodological and statistical instruments to strengthen the results and serve as a basis for decision-making for the improvement of the Advisory Councils for Sustainable Development.

The study is useful, considering the lack of studies that evaluate the impact of the Advisory Councils at the national level. With these data, an academic perspective is provided to measure the citizen effort added to the responsibility of environmental policies, for environmental governance.

#### References

Baker L. Judy. 2000. Evaluación del impacto de los proyectos de desarrollo en la pobreza. Manual para profesionales Banco Mundial. Washington, D.C. pp. 219

Gobierno Federal 2013. Plan Nacional de Desarrollo 2013-2018.

Ley General de Equilibrio Ecológico y Protección al Ambiente, 2008.

Torres, Verena; Ramos, N.; Lizazo, D.; Monteagudo, F.; Noda, Aida. Modelo estadístico para la medición del impacto de la innovación o transferencia tecnológica en la rama agropecuaria. Revista Cubana de Ciencia Agrícola, vol. 42, núm. 2, 2008, pp. 133-139. Instituto de Ciencia Animal. La Habana, Cuba.

Oviedo Heidi y Campo A.A. 2005. Metodología de la investigación y lectura crítica de estudios. Aproximación al uso del coeficiente alfa de Cronbach. Revista Colombiana de Psiquiatría. vol XXIV/ No. 4/2005 pag. 572-580

SEMARNAT 2008-2011. Respuestas emitidas por el Consejo Consultivo por el Desarrollo Sustentable Región Sureste (http://:consejos.semarnat.gob.mx).

GÓMEZ-RIVERA, Petrona. Citizen Participation in the Consultative Councils for Sustainable Development (CCDS) in Southeast Mexico: An Academic Perspective. Journal-Urban-Rural and Regional Economy. 2020